In San Francisco, racism and birth outcomes are intertwined. Black and Pacific Islander (PI) families experience adverse birth outcomes at significantly higher rates than other communities. Before a Black or PI child sets foot in the world, he or she is affected by historical and ongoing discrimination in housing, jobs, criminal justice, and health care.

Expecting Justice was formed nearly two years ago to address these inequities. Expecting Justice is a cross-sector initiative consisting of city agencies, community-based organizations, health providers, and community members. Using racial equity as a framework, we have developed a multi-component approach to address key dimensions of vulnerability faced by Black and PI women during pregnancy and childbirth.

We believe that what Expecting Justice is undertaking is meaningful and necessary and we are committed to support this important work until San Francisco has become a city in which every baby, no matter their race, has a healthy start.

**Birth and Racism in SF**

Because of the overall small rate of Pacific Islander births in San Francisco, we do not report the annual preterm birth rate for this community. Between 2012-2016, the preterm birth rate for Pacific Islanders in San Francisco was 10.4%, the second highest rate in the city.1
Common Agenda

Problem Statement

The enduring legacy of racism continues to shape our city’s interactions with Black and Pacific Islander women. We need a transformational approach that values and includes African-American and Pacific Islander women throughout their lives in order to improve birth outcomes.

Big Goal

Expecting Justice wants every birth to be a healthy birth within San Francisco’s Black and Pacific Islander populations by the year 2030 and that providers, public health professionals, and institutional leaders who interact with pregnant women have a shared understanding of and sense of responsibility to address racism and racial health disparities.

Strategic Focus Areas

- Anti-Racism Promotion
- Doula Access
- Pregnancy Income Supplement
Expecting Justice is taking an innovative, multicomponent approach to reduce the astonishing rates of preterm birth and infant mortality among Black and PI communities. Using a racial equity framework, the approach includes 1) racial equity trainings with social service and clinical providers to eliminate racist policies and practices that negatively impact Black and PI people, 2) a doula intervention to fight racism and related maternal stress in the healthcare setting, and 3) a pregnancy income supplement program to address the upstream impacts of racism by reducing poverty and associated stress.

These three components complement one another to address key dimensions of vulnerability faced by Black and PI people during pregnancy and childbirth: interpersonal and institutional racism in the healthcare and public health systems, plus structural racism manifested as the racial wealth gap. Based on deep engagement with community members and other stakeholders, we believe this combined approach is imperative to ensure safe and healthy childbirth for Black and PI mothers in our city.
Guiding Principles

Expecting Justice is guided in their work by the following five principles

Women are precious

We see girls and women in San Francisco as precious and valuable.

Life Course

We seek to address the social determinants of health that impact women, their children and the fathers of their children across the lifespan

Racism as a root cause

We acknowledge the racist, historical underpinnings of the many structural barriers that lead to preterm birth among women of color in San Francisco today

Sustainability

We aim to align funding and incentives for preterm birth, while recognizing that improving conditions for pregnant women of color requires investments, opportunities, and reparations for communities of color.

Mothers’ voices

Through our work, we commit to elevating the voices of those most affected by preterm birth by opening communications and engagement with communities of color as well as building capacity among mothers of color.
The Problem

In SF, a Black infant is almost twice as likely to be born prematurely compared to a White infant (13.8% versus 7.3%, 2012-2016) and Pacific Islander infants have the second highest preterm birth rate at 10.4%.\(^1\) Preterm births (PTB), those that occur before the 37th week of gestation, carry the highest risk of infant mortality and also long-lasting health and developmental challenges, the impact of which is felt for a lifetime by these children and their families.\(^2\)

Disparities in preterm birth are a manifestation of racial inequity.

In a study of mothers, 36.9% of Black women reported often feeling worried about racial discrimination, compared to 5.5% of White women.\(^3\)

Those that worried often had a higher PTB rate than those who did not worry often.

Black women who reported being treated unfairly at work were more likely to experience preterm birth.\(^4\)

Maternal stress represents a significant risk factor for shorter gestation and an increased risk of preterm birth.\(^5\) And growing evidence suggests that differential quality of care contributes to racial disparities in perinatal outcomes.\(^6,9\)
Black and Pacific Islander women have the **highest rates of prenatal morbidity** and the **lowest rates of breastfeeding** in San Francisco, yet women from these communities are the **least likely to seek prenatal care**.\(^1\)\(^,\)\(^10\)

Recent research conducted with Black women in San Francisco and other Bay Area counties reveals that,

> the relationships between pregnant black individuals and their health-care providers are often a source of stress, anger and distress during a vulnerable time.\(^9\)

The majority of respondents felt fearful of maternal health systems and reported experiences of disrespect and coercion when interacting with providers.\(^9\)

**Doula Access**

In 2018, Expecting Justice partnered with SisterWeb, CPMC Foundation, and President of the San Francisco Board of Supervisors Malia Cohen to launch a community doula program to provide culturally concordant community doula care for Black and PI birthing people in San Francisco at no cost to participating birthing people.

Published data indicates that doula care is one of the most promising interventions to improve labor and delivery outcomes, especially for low-income women of color.\(^11\)\(^-\)\(^15\)
Key outcomes associated with doula support include:

- reduced preterm birth and low birth weight rates
- increased initiation of breastfeeding
- reduced negative feelings about birth experiences
- increased cost savings in medical expenditures

**Activities**

**Funding**
Secured $460k from CPMC foundation and additional $200k from the San Francisco Health Plan to help build a community doula program in San Francisco in partnership with SisterWeb Community Doula Network.

**Program Goal:** To support an innovative community-based doula program and to cultivate a network of peer doulas from within African American and Pacific Islander communities in San Francisco to increase birth equity and decrease birth disparities.

**Integration**
Established Hospital Champion Dyads to create an ongoing system for community doula integration into the birth team and coordination of hospital staff training. These dyads can facilitate bi-directional communication and feedback between the labor and delivery staff and the doulas with the goal of changing the culture in Labor and Delivery wards.

**Evaluation**
Funded by UCSF's Preterm Birth Initiative California (PTBi-CA), UC Berkeley researchers will use community-based participatory research methodologies and quantitative data collection to evaluate this new doula program.

**Programmatic Support**
Convened a doula access working group made up of local community doulas, social service providers, medical providers, and community residents. The work group helped to inform programmatic planning and strategic decision-making for SisterWeb’s community doula program.

**Policy**
In partnership with NHeLP, led a statewide policy workgroup that explored the options for making doula services a Medi-Cal covered benefit with a goal of advancing legislation.
San Francisco is a wealthy and well-resourced city, yet many of its residents, especially the continuously marginalized Black and Pacific Islander populations, experience extreme income inequalities, compared to their white and Asian counterparts, and significant disparities in birth outcomes.  

Structural racism is an important factor driving this inequity.

"The doctors told me that I had a high risk pregnancy, so I had to take two tests that were $800 each, and one that was $1,000! I had private insurance but was still not making enough money. I had just gotten out of debt but these bills sent me back on a downward spiral of credit card debt."

Well-documented historical and current discrimination such as redlining, urban renewal, unequal pay and a lack of employment opportunities underlie differences in income and wealth for Black and Pacific Islander communities, making it difficult for families to meet basic needs, resulting in higher stress and a related toll on physical health.

San Francisco has one of the greatest degrees of income inequality in the United States:
Black and PI women in SF face unique social and environmental risk factors, including substandard housing and housing instability, greater exposure to conditions of concentrated poverty including crime and violence, limited access to quality foods and adequate nutrition, unequal educational opportunities, and poorer-quality employment opportunities.

The strain of ongoing financial insecurity contributes to chronic stress and is associated with premature birth. Although San Francisco has programs to address poverty, the current focus is not enough to close the gaps. The high rates of preterm birth experienced by the Black and PI community require a more urgent and upstream intervention.

Common issues in current programs include:

- Low-income eligibility threshold
- Benefits have low purchasing power
- Constant risk of denial or disqualification
- Increases stress and jeopardizes maternal mental health

"I was so stressed about preparing for my pregnancy and had a fear of losing my son. I wanted to give him what he deserves, but that was also stressful. I never got to enjoy my pregnancy so I wanted to enjoy him when he got here but didn’t get to do that because I had to think about how to provide for him."
Expecting Justice is piloting the first unconditional income supplement during pregnancy in the United States and will reach 100 low-income Black and PI pregnant women in San Francisco. The program aims to distribute a monthly income supplement of $700-$1,000 per month for the duration of a person’s pregnancy and then for the first two months of the baby's life, with a goal of eventually implementing a supplement for up to two years post-pregnancy.

Why cash? Why pregnancy?

Cash during pregnancy → Ability to plan for the future/sense of control → Improve material circumstances

Reduce stress → Reduced parent and child exposure and vulnerability to stressors

- Housing security
- Food security
- Mental health
- Healthcare utilization
- Health behavior

Improved maternal and infant outcomes

Early study results have been promising:

A recent quasi-experimental study in Manitoba, Canada found that an approximately 10% increase in income from an unconditional income supplement during pregnancy resulted in reductions of low birth weight and preterm birth.


desired outcomes:

- Reduced preterm birth by 17.5%
- Reduced low birth weight by 21%
- 10% increase in income during pregnancy
Expecting Justice will evaluate the pilot to better understand how families are using this additional income and to determine the health and economic impacts of the income support. If the pilot is successful, we will collaborate with city agencies to identify a path toward sustainability and scalability.

HSA has committed to fund two Public Service Trainee positions to serve as outreach workers/research assistants for this income supplement pilot for a one-year period. These two positions will be staffed by low-income community residents and this commitment represents a $63,258 in-kind contribution from HSA.

First 5 SF has committed to extending the availability of income supplements postnatally for the pilot’s 100 participants. First 5 will leverage their role in managing the city’s childcare subsidy, normally only available for low-income parents who are working or in school full time, to offer the mothers in our pilot the option of staying home with their babies and using $1,600 per month child care subsidy as an income supplement instead. This benefit will be available to every woman in our pilot cohort from when their child is two months until their child reaches kindergarten-age.
The tremendous amount of institutional racism that pregnant Black and PI people face in San Francisco reverberates throughout our systems and can be quantified for almost all socioeconomic criteria. Economically, San Francisco has some of the highest levels of racial income inequality in the nation\(^\text{24}\). Academically, Black students in San Francisco have the lowest achievement rates in the state\(^\text{36}\). Despite making up only around 5% of the city’s residents, African Americans make up over 50% of the jail population, and nearly 40% of SF’s homeless population\(^\text{27}\). Furthermore, during pregnancy, Black people in San Francisco are four times as likely to be turned away at a prenatal visit compared to White people\(^\text{22}\).

### Education

- **84%** of White children graduate high school in SF.
- **58%** of Black/AA children graduate high school in SF.

### Housing

- Women who live in public housing have a higher preterm birth rate than those that live in standard housing:
  - **7.7** Preterm birth rate for a woman living in standard housing.
  - **9.8** Preterm birth rate for a woman living in public housing.

### Healthcare

- Pacific Islanders make up 0.4% of the SF population but represent 10% of the women of childbearing age living in public housing.
Leading researchers have called for health care systems to address racism within their own institutions as a means of addressing racial disparities in perinatal and other health outcomes. Specifically, health care systems must address racism in their recruitment, hiring, and retention/promotion practices because there is compelling evidence that workforce diversity can be an important tool in reducing disparities in health outcomes. Additionally, studies have shown that provider implicit bias impacts not only the quality of care patients of color receive, but may also impact how patients of color perceive their own medical condition as well as their self-efficacy and health-seeking behaviors. Lastly, the ways racism impacts social service institutions’ policies, practices, priorities, and resource distribution must be acknowledged and redressed to close the racial gaps in perinatal and other health care outcomes.
Anti-Racism Promotion

Black and Pacific Islander birthing people in San Francisco face discrimination in their interactions with healthcare and social service systems every day. Expecting Justice recognizes the need to focus on systems change to address the complex manifestation of racism that affect women during pregnancy and childbirth.

Expecting Justice is expanding the reach and impact of the race equity training initiative, Health Equity and Anti-Racism Training Up San Francisco (HEART Up SF), to increase racial sensitivity among providers, public health professionals, and institutional leaders who interact with pregnant people.

Through trainings, seminars and workshops, HEART Up SF helps participants, develop an understanding that racism is at the root of health disparities, increase self-efficacy to engage in racial dialogue, and cultivate a sense of responsibility to address racism and racial health disparities. These individual efforts culminate into shifts in organization culture and ultimately in policies that lift up Black and PI communities.

Expecting Justice Anti-Racism Trainings in the Last Year

- 3 Quarterly Provider Meetings for Primary Care
- Nurse Leadership Conference
- Several Bay Area wide convenings
- 2 DPH Public Health Nursing Quarterly Meetings
- MCAH All-Staff Meeting
- Multiple citywide convenings
- MCAH Race Equity Brown Bag Series
- Reached over 500 city & county staff
- Included in UCSF Medical School electives
- 4 Grand Rounds at ZSFG
Logic Model

Levels of Racism and How it Impacts Birth

**Structural Racism**

The joint operation of San Francisco’s institutions produce racial inequities that create barriers making it difficult for black and pacific islander communities to meet basic needs.

**Institutional Racism**

Racist institutional and cultural practices manifests in the form of many social and environmental racial inequities that perpetuate poor health outcomes in the black and pacific islander community in San Francisco.

**Interpersonal Racism**

Racism and racist interactions that occur between individuals shows up in San Francisco’s healthcare and social service settings, negatively impacting the ways black and pacific islander communities get treated and access services.

---

**Income**

The strain of ongoing financial insecurity directly contributes to chronic stress and is associated with premature birth.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2013-2017 SF Median Annual Household Income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black families: $30,235</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5-yr preterm birth rate in SF

- **13.8%** Black/African American
- **10.4%** Pacific Islander
- **9%** SF overall

**Student Achievement**

Less education is associated with preterm birth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Black students</th>
<th>All students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English Proficiency: 23%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Math Proficiency: 15%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Employment**

Unemployment is associated with preterm birth

Within CCSF, one of the largest employers in SF, **black people are fired at 2 TIMES the rate of other employees**.

**Provider Interaction**

Inadequate prenatal care is associated with preterm birth

In 2014-16, **28.3% of black moms** were told a provider either would not take her insurance or accept her as a patient during her pregnancy.

---

**Expecting Justice Solutions**

**Pregnancy Income Supplement**

Monthly cash stipend for pregnant black and pacific islanders in San Francisco.

**Anti-Racism Promotion**

Anti-racism training targeting providers to produce change in attitudes and behaviors toward black and pacific islander clients.

**Doula Access**

Culturally-concordant, community doula care to support birthing people facing discrimination in clinical settings.

---

**Imagine this in SF!**

In Manitoba, Canada, one study showed that a **10% increase in income during pregnancy led to reduced preterm birth by 17.5%** and reduced low birthweight by **21%**.

**What if SF could do this!**

In Genesee County, their anti-racism training for healthcare providers led to a decrease in infant mortality rates in the county from a high of 23.5 to 15.2 deaths per 1,000 live births.

**SF can produce these results!**

A Cochrane review that looked at 27 trials of continuous support for women during childbirth found that having a community doula reduced preterm birth rates, low birthweight rates, and improved their experience with labor and delivery.
Other Activities

In addition to supporting the Steering Committee focus areas, Expecting Justice participates in ongoing activities that contribute to healthy births.

Mutually Reinforcing Activities

California Perinatal Equity Initiative

Expecting Justice has taken a lead role in the execution of the SFDPH, MCAH PEI Planning Grant activities. The backbone team provided deep dive findings for Local Needs Assessment and Environmental Scan related to Black Maternal Health in San Francisco. Expecting Justice engaged several stakeholder groups to gather input about unmet needs of Black birthing people in San Francisco and synthesized the results to directly contribute to the intervention selection process. Expecting Justice championed the planning process to implement Be Heard San Francisco, an innovative community engagement platform that will serve as a community-driven, opt-in, civic engagement tool where San Franciscans can have their voices heard through polls and surveys about improving health outcomes in the City and County of San Francisco. Expecting Justice is also collaborating with other bay area counties to develop a regional public health awareness campaign to be launched 2019-20.

UCSF PTBi-CA Collaboratories

Expecting Justice partnered with and co-sponsored several PTBi-CA Collaboratories centering Expecting Justice’s focus areas:
· The Healing Power of Doulas (January 2019)
· How Can We Close the Racial Gap in Preterm Birth Rates? (February 2019)
· Cash During Pregnancy: A Promising Approach for Improving Health Inequities at Birth (May 2019)

Policy Advocacy

Expecting Justice supports the advancement of the following bills in partnership with Black Women for Wellness, Act for Women and Girls, California Nurse-Midwives Association, Naral Pro-choice California, Western Center on Law and Poverty, and other local organizations, through research, material development, and media advocacy:

SB 464 - California Dignity in Pregnancy and Childbirth Act
which would create an implicit bias training program for perinatal care providers that includes required initial basic training through the program and a refresher course every two years thereafter. The measure would also require the California Public Health Department to collect “better data on maternal mortality rates and require hospitals to provide patients with more information on how to file discrimination complaints.”

AB 241 - Implicit bias: continuing education: requirements
which would require continuing education programs for physicians, surgeons, registered nurses, and physician assistants to include training on understanding implicit bias in medical treatment.
Expecting Justice and SFDPH MCAH Racial Equity Champions co-led and developed a curriculum for a UCSF Mini-Course on Racial Equity for future physicians. The mini-course provided tools and skills to prepare students to both work with clients from all racial backgrounds and change systems that uphold racial hierarchies. The mini-course allowed students to process and practice the work of creating an equitable society in which everyone, regardless of skin color, can have the opportunity to be healthy.

Racial Equity Tools

Expecting Justice has developed a Racial Equity 101 Toolkit that provides a menu of tools to integrate racial equity into your existing practices. The tools in this document are organized by Government Alliance on Race & Equity (GARE)’s “Normalize, Organize, Operationalize” framework from GARE and Race Forward’s “Actions to Advance Racial Equity”. Each tool in this document can be applied to ongoing work to self-reflect, cultivate workforce, develop communication skills, improve quality of services, and hire/engage with HR, etc.

Workforce Development

Expecting Justice and MCAH are co-developing a race equity-focused mentorship program in partnership with MPH students from various universities and FACES for the Future through John O’Connell High School. Activities include supporting students of color in their professional development, such as informational interviews, job shadowing, resume-building, and overall mentorship, while cultivating their racial equity skills.

Racism as a Root Cause (RRC) Approach

We seek to empower public health practitioners by introducing a framework for addressing racism as a root cause. The Racism as a Root Cause (RRC) approach can help guide and structure the important work of dismantling racism so Black, Indigenous and other racially marginalized groups can finally have an equal opportunity for good health.
Steering Committee

Alice Chen
Chief Medical Officer
San Francisco Health Network

Bina Shrimali
Senior Researcher
Federal Reserve Bank of San Francisco

Davina Counte
Subject Matter Expert

Ingrid Mezquita
Director of the Office of Early Care and Education
San Francisco Human Services Agency

Kim Coates
Executive Director
San Francisco Unified School District

Maria Su
Executive Director
Department of Children, Youth and Their Families

Sabra Bell
Subject Matter Expert

Anastasia Gordon
Director
Bayview YMCA

Brittni Chicuata
Policy Director
San Francisco Human Rights Commission

Farah Faramand
Community Behavioral Health
San Francisco Children, Youth and Families

Jonathan Fuchs
Director
UCSF Preterm Birth Initiative

Kim Scurr
Vice President
UCSF Benioff Children’s Hospital San Francisco

Martha Ryan
Executive Director
Homeless Prenatal Program

Sara Kennedy
Chief Medical Officer
Planned Parenthood NorCal

Ayanna Bennett
Director of Interdivisional Initiatives
SFDPH

Dan Kelly
Director of Planning
San Francisco Human Services Agency

Hector Sanchez-Flores
Executive Director
National Compadres Network

Jessica Wiley
Children and Family Program Manager
San Francisco Health Plan

Lyn-Tise Jones
Subject Matter Expert
OMI Director, YMCA SF

Milika Funaki
Community Engagement Consultant

Backbone Team

Zea Malawa
Physician Director
Expecting Justice

Solaire Spellen
Program Associate
Expecting Justice

Jenna Gaarde
Evaluation
SFDPH

Loren Newman
Graphic Design
Lolatti Designs

Breezy Powell
Administrative Assistant
Expecting Justice

Jodi Stookey
Data
SFDPH
References

References


34. Wydick, B. (2018). When Are cash transfers transformative?.


40. UCSF Data Sharing Initiatives: Diversity Data, Fall 2018 Demographic Data. Retrieved from https://diversity.ucsf.edu/reports-data/diversity-data#infographic


